
| | |
|----------------------------|---|
| REPORT TITLE: | TENDER 2008. 027 – LARATINGA TRAIL STAGE 2 |
| DATE OF MEETING: | 20 JULY 2009 |
| AUTHOR: | ANDREW GOTZHEIM BILL GRAHAM |
| AUTHOR'S TITLE: | MANAGER HORTICULTURAL PROJECTS CONTRACTS & PROPERTY CO-ORDINATOR |
| FILE NUMBER: | 70/030/198 |
| DEPARTMENT: | INFRASTRUCTURE & PROJECTS |
| DEPARTMENT MANAGER: | BRIAN CLANCEY |

Moved Councillor Zanker that Council:

1. That pursuant to Section 90(2) and 90(3) of the Local Government Act 1999 the District Council of Mount Barker orders that the public be excluded from attendance at the meeting to consider in confidence matters regarding:
(k) tenders for the supply of goods, the provision of services or the carrying out of works.
2. That the Chief Executive Officer, General Manager Infrastructure & Projects, General Manager Strategy, Development & Communities, General Manager Corporate and the Minute Secretary be permitted to remain in the room.

Seconded Councillor Irvine and CARRIED

Moved Councillor Bails that Council

3. Awards tender 2008.027, Laratinga Trail Mt Barker Homemaker Centre to Cornerstone College to CAMCO (SA) Pty Ltd for the amount of \$884,559.76 exclusive of GST to complete all of the works associated with the tender.
4. Notes the construction of the linear trail from the rear of the Mt Barker Homemaker Centre to Cornerstone College at an estimated cost of \$1,021,155, which contains the provision for contingencies of \$100,000 and fencing requirements (as per attachment 2) and is within the project budget of \$1,050,000.
5. Authorises the Chief Executive Officer to execute relevant contract documents.
6. Notes that a media release is to be issued.

Seconded Councillor Wilksch and CARRIED

Moved Councillor Zanker that Council

7. Orders pursuant to Section 91(7) and (9) of the Local Government Act 1999 that the financial amounts contained in Attachment 1 are kept confidential until 20 July 2010 given they include commercial information of a confidential nature.
8. That subject to Section 90 of the Local Government Act 1999 as amended, the public be readmitted to the meeting at the conclusion of the item.

Seconded Councillor Campbell and CARRIED

17.2 **REPORT TITLE:** **TENDER 2008. 027 – LARATINGA TRAIL
STAGE 2**

DATE OF MEETING: 20 JULY 2009

AUTHOR: **ANDREW GOTZHEIM
BILL GRAHAM**

AUTHOR'S TITLE: **MANAGER HORTICULTURAL PROJECTS
CONTRACTS & PROPERTY CO-
ORDINATOR**

REPRESENTORS: **NIL**

FILE NUMBER: **70/030/198**

ATTACHMENTS: **1 TRAIL SITE MAP
2 OXIGEN PTY LTD RECOMMENDATION
3 LINEAR TRAIL SCOPE OF WORKS
4 LINEAR TRAIL DESIGN**

DEPARTMENT: **INFRASTRUCTURE & PROJECTS**

DEPARTMENT **BRIAN CLANCEY**
MANAGER:

PURPOSE

To seek Council's approval to award Tender 2008.027 – Laratinga Trail Stage 2 to CAMCO (SA) Pty Ltd.

RECOMMENDATION

That Council:

1. That pursuant to Section 90(2) and 90(3) of the Local Government Act 1999 the District Council of Mount Barker orders that the public be excluded from attendance at the meeting to consider in confidence matters regarding:

(k) tenders for the supply of goods, the provision of services or the carrying out of works.
2. That the Chief Executive Officer, General Manager Infrastructure & Projects, General Manager Strategy, Development & Communities, General Manager Corporate and the Minute Secretary be permitted to remain in the room.
3. Awards tender 2008.027, Laratinga Trail Mt Barker Homemaker Centre to Cornerstone College to CAMCO (SA) Pty Ltd for the amount of \$995,585.95 exclusive of GST to complete all of the works associated with the tender.

4. Notes the construction of the linear trail from the rear of the Mt Barker Homemaker Centre to Cornerstone College at an estimated cost of \$1,021,155, which contains the provision for contingencies of \$100,000 and fencing requirements (as per attachment 2) and is within the project budget of \$1,050,000.
5. Authorises the Chief Executive Officer to execute relevant contract documents.
6. Notes that a media release is to be issued.
7. Orders pursuant to Section 91(7) and (9) of the Local Government Act 1999 that the financial amounts contained in Attachment 1 are kept confidential until 20 July 2010 given they include commercial information of a confidential nature.
8. That subject to Section 90 of the Local Government Act 1999 as amended, the public be readmitted to the meeting at the conclusion of the item.

BACKGROUND

The proposed extension of the linear trail is the third stage of the primary bike transport route to the Mt Barker township effectively linking one side of the town with the other by way of a three metre wide shared pedestrian / cyclist pathway.

There is a need to provide a safe route for cyclists and pedestrians to Connect Anembo Park and Littlehampton to Mt Barker.

The development of the trail extension along the route recommended in the trail design drawings would also allow safe access to local schools, Mountain Pool, Dunn & Bickle Park (Tourist Park) and ultimately Anembo Park. (As per agenda item of 15th December 2008 adopting the trail route post community consultation)

Scope of Works.

The scope of works for the construction of the Linear trail extension includes all earthworks and engineering requirements and landscaping as per attachment 3. Standards are to be in accordance with Council's "Shared Pathways and Cycle way Design and Construction Specification".

DISCUSSION

Expression of Interest

In accordance with Council's Procurement policy initially an Expression of Interest ("EOI") process was undertaken to attract suitably qualified contractors interested in undertaking the works.

Respondents were required to provide the following information in their Responses:

- a) Company information & key personnel proposed for the project
- b) Capacity & method statement to carry out the works
- c) Details of quality management systems
- d) Details of OHS&W policies & procedures
- e) Details of successful traffic management plans for similar projects
- f) Details of similar successful projects including time performance
- g) Details of similar project specific environmental considerations & outcomes
- h) Contact details of 3 referees

Council received EOI's from eleven contractors, these being:

1. Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd
2. MATAG Constructions Pty Ltd
3. Terrain Services Pty Ltd
4. JB Civil Solutions Pty Ltd & Colin Share Landscapes
5. Hakea Landscape & Revegetation Services Pty Ltd
6. Landscape Construction Services Pty Ltd
7. Civil Tech Pty Ltd
8. Landscape Environs Pty Ltd
9. JMS Mining & Civil Pty Ltd
10. M & B Civil Engineering Pty Ltd
11. Camco (SA) Pty Ltd

The EOIs were assessed by the following panel members:

- Andrew Gotzheim – Horticultural Projects Manager
- Bill Graham – Contracts & Property Co-ordinator
- Mr Jared Wilson – Senior Landscape Architect Oxigen Landscape Designers

Tender process

Following assessment of the respondents against the abovementioned criteria as well as reference checks the evaluation panel selected the following to be invited to tender for the construction works:

1. JB Civil Solutions Pty Ltd & Colin Share Landscapes
2. Civil Tech Pty Ltd
3. JMS Civil & Mining Pty Ltd
4. CAMCO (SA) Pty Ltd

These Tenderers were required to expand on:

- a) Relevant experience;
- b) Key personnel;
- c) Resources;
- d) Demonstrated understanding;
- e) Environmental sustainability credentials; and
- f) Provide a project specific traffic management plan.

Tenderers were also required to attend a compulsory visit(advised by email and phone call) to the site in order to emphasise the need to minimise the impact of the works on pedestrian and traffic convenience during the works and which would assist them to prepare a project specific traffic management plan. JMS Civil & Mining Pty Ltd did not attend this site meeting and was not considered in any subsequent evaluation.

5. Tenders were received from

JB Civil Solutions Pty Ltd & Colin Share Landscapes

Civil Tech Pty Ltd

JMS Civil & Mining Pty Ltd

CAMCO (SA) Pty Ltd and evaluated by:

- Andrew Gotzheim – Horticultural Projects Manager
- Bill Graham – Contracts & Property Co-ordinator
- Ian Powell – Commercial Assets Manager
- Jared Wilson – Senior Landscape Architect, Oxigen Pty Ltd

Oxigen Pty Ltd prepared the design and specification and have been engaged to:

- a) Assist with the evaluation of EOI's and submitted tenders;
- b) Compile a recommendation on the outcome of the evaluation of tenders;
- c) Assist with the superintending of the contract.

Initially tenders were assessed on price and then on the non-financial criteria. Tendered prices can be seen in the attachment to this report. The non financial criteria attracted weightings which in the opinion of the panel reflected the importance of the criteria to the project. Scores were then allocated on a scale of 1 – 10. The criteria for the evaluation of non-financial criteria included the following:

1. Relevant experience;
2. Key personnel;
3. Tenderers resources;
4. Demonstrated understanding of the project;
5. Environmental sustainability; and
6. Traffic management plans.

A summary of the non-financial scores can be seen in the attachment to this report.

In accordance with Council's Procurement policy the total value of the contract will be available to the public.

Section of trail Parallel to the Park n ride Site

Discussions have been held with Australian Transit Enterprises in relation to the funding of the section of trail adjacent to their facility as per the Deed Agreement entered into with council in connection with the development of the Park n Ride facility.

The expected Park n Ride developer contribution is around \$110,000 (including GST) based on tender prices provided by the preferred contractor to Council.

These discussions have been going on for approximately nine months with ATE disputing the interpretation of the wording of the deed. Council's legal advice is quite clear, that the wording of the deed agreement with Australian Transit Enterprises states that "Nimrod will construct the Linear Trail works at its full cost in accordance with the Council's design specification for the Linear Trail Works" and is indisputable and clear in its intent.

Council has called in the bank guarantee of \$100,000 for the construction of the trail adjacent to the park n ride prior to expiry on the 3rd August 2009.

The guarantee is unconditional and must be called in prior to this date otherwise both parties would have to enter protracted negotiations and possibly go to arbitration. Consistent with our legal advice, Council has recently requested that the guarantee be called in and is awaiting the ANZ Bank to release the funds. ATE has been advised

that the bank guarantee has been called in and that they will be responsible for any additional costs over and above the \$100,000 attributed to the cost of works within their section of trail. These works will be undertaken by the Council contractor at the full cost of ATE.

ATE has written to Council requesting a further meeting .

Cornerstone College to Freeway Tunnel

In addition discussions are continuing with DETI and Steam ranger to obtain a licence over of a portion of the rail corridor (some 120 metres) to construct the rail crossing and associated boardwalk within the final section from Cornerstone College to the Childs Road tunnel under the freeway.

It is anticipated that there will be a lead in period of approximately 4 weeks from the time of the appointment of the contractor until construction will commence. The target construction start time is mid to late August 2009 weather permitting. The target construction time is 16 – 18 weeks.

CAMCO has agreed that should the works for the section from Cornerstone College to the Childs Road tunnel not proceed this will not impact on its tendered price for the remainder of the works. This is based on securing all approvals from DETI and Steam ranger and securing required funding from the State and Federal Governments. Funding applications has been submitted to Bike SA and the Federal Governments Cycle Fund to undertake the construction of the trail from Cornerstone College to the Freeway Tunnel and finally to Anembo Park.

The Cornerstone College to the Freeway has been designed and Council is awaiting written approval from DETI for the use of part of the Freeway reserve. The final section to Anembo park is still to be designed and this is anticipated to commence within the next three months.

It is anticipated that the outcome of these grant applications will be known in mid August 2009. Should Council be successful in securing additional funds a report will be presented to Council.(funding of approximately \$700,000 has been sought)

An official opening will be arranged shortly following completion of the trail extension works.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS

1. Financial/budget

The trail development has been divided into four sections with the following tendered costs for trail construction outlined below.

The construction standard is significantly higher than the existing

trail to reduce the maintenance due to cracking caused by excessive soil movement as has been experienced previously. The design and construction standards for the trail extension are consistent with the Standards Document presented to council for endorsement earlier in the agenda.

Stage Costings.

1. Home Maker Centre to the Park n Ride southern boundary (Chainage 1654 -1116).- Distance 538 metres \$316,509 (ex gst)
2. Park n Ride Site (Chainage 1116- 930) Distance 186 metres \$ 100,120 (ex gst)
3. Tourist Park Southern Boundary to Cornerstone College boundary (chainage 930- 440) Distance 490 metres \$457,929 (ex gst)

The total cost of construction for the linear trail from the Homemaker Centre to Cornerstone College. is **\$1,021,155.**(ex GST) includes a sum of \$37,000 for fencing of adjoining properties and a contingencies allowance of \$100,000. (Sections 1 – 3) This figure does not include the section from Cornerstone College to the Childs Road Tunnel .

Funding applications have been submitted to Bicycle SA and the Federal Government seeking funds to complete this stage from Cornerstone College to the Freeway Tunnel (Childs Road) and to undertake the final stage of design and construction to Anembo Park Littlehampton. Confirmation of Council's success or otherwise is expected in August 2009. Design is currently under way for this section to Anembo Park.

The funding for the development of the linear trail is contained within the draft 2009/10 budget being \$1,050,000 to complete the trail construction from the Mt Barker Homemaker Centre to Cornerstone College.

Budgetted grants confirmed,

Planning SA (2 grants were provided to Council)
(Open Space) \$270,000

Planning SA (Open Space) \$128,000

Federal Government \$184,000

ATE contribution (Bank guarantee) \$100,000

Net cost to Council \$492,098, (includes tourist park contribution of \$25,000 and developer contributions funds \$20,000).

TOTAL \$1,050,000

In addition to the above funding it was recommended in the report to Council (December 15th 2008) that should there be a funding deficit to complete the trail extension to the Freeway Tunnel consideration be given to utilising funds from the Indirect Developer Contributions which could be utilised to complete the Linear trail to the Childs Road Tunnel. (This cost is estimated at \$200,000 subject to final design.)

The report to Council on the 15th of December 2008 also indicated that a contribution to the cost of works be made by the Tourist Park as the works immediately adjacent the Tourist Park would directly benefit the park. This contribution was \$25,000 and has been budgeted for in the 2009 /10 draft budget as part of Council's net cost of the project.

2. Legal

Expressions of Interest and tenders have been called in accordance with Council's Procurement policy.

A formal contract with the successful contractor will be established. Council has received legal advice that Australian Transit Enterprises (ATE) are responsible for the full cost of the construction of the linear trail adjacent to their site (being 186 metres) as per the signed deed of agreement.

Council has executed a licence with Cornerstone College allowing the linear trail to be constructed and utilised within the eastern section of the College. The agreed tenure of the licence is 100 years.

3. Staffing/Work Plans

The Tendering process, assessment and award have been undertaken by existing staff of Council and Oxygen Landscape Architects.

The construction of the linear trail will be undertaken by external contractors and superintended by Council Officers and Oxygen .

4. Environmental

The re vegetation of the creek system would occur as part of the development of the Linear trail extension . The rehabilitation of the creek system is to include landscaping with local indigenous species to provide suitable habitat for native fauna and improve water quality which has been significantly affected by pollution and leaf drop over many years. Local schools, environmental and conservation groups will be invited to participate in the replanting program.

The proposed re vegetation will compliment works previously undertaken

The landscaping component has been included in the construction works and will be maintained by the contractors for a period of 52 weeks.

It is anticipated to undertake these works in the first available planting season upon completion of the construction of the trail.

5. Social

The development of the trail extension would provide a safer transport corridor for both cyclists and pedestrians and provide a linkage between the Town Centre, local schools and community facilities such as Dunn Park .

6. Strategic Plans

The development of the Linear Trail falls within the Goals of Leisure,

Recreation, Arts & Sport being to support, encourage and provide a range of accessible facilities, programs and events that everybody in the community will be able to enjoy.

Council officers are currently undertaking a Shared Path Master Plan project for Mt Barker, Littlehampton, and Nairne as part of the 09 / 10 budget to be undertaken by consultants. Community consultation is currently occurring on a draft Transport Master Plan. A key objective in the plan is increased levels of walking and cycling.

7. Risk Assessment.

There are no risks identified within the framework of Council's Emergency Risk Management Plan that have an effect on the construction of the Linear Trail extension. Council has had a safety audit undertaken by Echelon (Local Government Mutual liability Scheme) on the Laratinga Linear Trail which included the design of the extension from the Homemaker Centre to Anembo Park.

The Trail extension will commence at the rear of the Homemaker Centre (where the two creeks meet) and conclude at this stage at Cornerstone College (approximately 100 metres from Cameron Road) where the trail will join with the schools internal trail to their wetland.

Council officers are currently working on costings to undertake the next stage of design from the Freeway tunnel to Anembo Park.

There were no major risks identified within the recommended trail route or design but some modifications were required to the crossings. A risk matrix has been prepared for the entire length of both trails. These issues have been addressed within the review of the trail design and the trail extension has been designed to meet current Australian Standards.

8. Asset Management

The development of the Linear Trail extension will meet the expectations of the asset management plan by ensuring that the trail construction is undertaken to accepted Australian Standards. The trail will be a three metre wide sealed asphalt pathway.

The depth of the base for the trail has been significantly increased (in comparison to the existing trail) to allow for the expected increased soil movement due to drought conditions. In addition an interlayer (fibre deck) will be utilised between the asphalt and the sub base to absorb potential soil movement.

The sub base has been increased (from 400mm under the existing linear trail) to 650mm incorporating a mix of quarry sand to ensure stability. This will effectively reduce future maintenance due to reduced cracking.

The trail has a life expectancy of approximately twenty years (minimum) before it would require major reconstruction works.

The construction detail specification for the trail is consistent with the Shared Pathways and cycle ways Design and Construction Specification.

Bridges and culverts have been designed to require minimal maintenance.

A risk matrix for the trail extension is currently being produced to identify and prioritise works that may be required along the trail in relation to on going maintenance. The audit recently undertaken on the trail and the risk matrix will be utilized in councils Asset Management

It is anticipated that there will be an annual cost of approximately ten thousand dollars (\$10,000) to maintain the trail from the Homemaker Centre to Cornerstone College and environs.

COMMUNITY CONSULTATION

1. Customer Needs Analysis

Targeted consultation has been undertaken with members of the community who lodged submissions as part of an extensive community consultation process and those directly affected by the recommended trail route. Letters will be sent to all residents adjacent to the trail route prior to the commencement of construction advising them of start dates and providing contact details of the contractor who has the responsibility of communicating with the residents to advise them when they will be working in their vicinity and to deal with any construction issues.

Promotion/Communications

The trail extension will be promoted through the local written media and updates, plans will be placed onto Council's web site. A media release will be prepared on the Linear Trail Extension construction given the significance of the project to the local community.

Site signage will be erected to acknowledge the funding partnerships with the State and Federal Governments.

ITEM 17.2 ATTACHMENT 1



oxygen

adding life
to environments

Landscape Architecture • Urban Design + Planning

7-11 Moger Lane
Adelaide SA 5000
T: 08 8132 7200
F: 08 8223 4966
E: design@oxygen.net.au
ABN: 22 107 472 284
© 2009

FOR CONSTRUCTION



LARATINGA TRAIL

STAGE 2 - DISTRICT COUNCIL OF MT BARKER - JUNE 2009

SURFACES + SETOUT

- 06.060.101 SURFACES + SETOUT 01
- 06.060.102 SURFACES + SETOUT 02
- 06.060.103 SURFACES + SETOUT 03
- 06.060.104 SURFACES + SETOUT 04
- 06.060.105 SURFACES + SETOUT 05
- 06.060.106 SURFACES + SETOUT 06
- 06.060.107 SURFACES + SETOUT 07
- 06.060.108 SURFACES + SETOUT 08
- 06.060.109 SURFACES + SETOUT 09
- 06.060.110 SURFACES + SETOUT 10
- 06.060.111 SURFACES + SETOUT 11
- 06.060.112 CAMERON ROAD PLAN
- 06.060.113 GAYLER STREET PLAN

DETAILS

- 06.060.114 PLANTING PLAN 01
- 06.060.115 PLANTING PLAN 02
- 06.060.116 DETAILS
- A066108 LONGITUDINAL SECTION 01
- A066108 LONGITUDINAL SECTION 02
- A066108 LONGITUDINAL SECTION 03
- 33-147200-3001 STRUCTURAL NOTES + DETAILS
- 33-147200-3002 FRAMING PLAN + DETAILS
- 33-147200-3003 FRAMING + FOOTING PLAN, SECTIONS + DETAILS
- G305-108 BRIDGE DETAILS

REVISION SET 2

ITEM 17.2 ATTACHMENT 2

24 June 2009

Andrew Gotzheim
District Council of Mt Barker
PO Box 54
Mount Barker SA 5251

Dear Andrew,

LARATINGA TRAIL STAGE 2

A public expression of interest was called for the project via the State Government tenders and contracts website. The expressions of interest were evaluated in conjunction with Council and a shortlist of contractors were invited to tender for the works. The shortlist included:

- Camco Pty Ltd
- Civil Tech Pty Ltd
- JB Civil in association with Colin Share Landscaping
- Downer EDI

Tenders closed at Council on 3 April 2009. Tenders were received from Camco (CAM), Civiltech (CIV) and JB Civil/Colin Share (JB). Downer EDI advised of their inability to tender due to workload.

Many items within the tenders required clarification and the assessment and evaluation was unable to proceed. All tenderers were given the opportunity to resubmit the required information and this provided sufficient information to conduct the tender evaluation.

As a result of the tender evaluation Council reviewed the scope of works and project budget. A revised documentation set was issued to the tenderers for repricing including a revised tender schedule identifying the work sections relating to funding contributions to assist with internal Council approvals.

JB Civil/Colin Share declined the invitation to submit a revised price.

Oxygen provided an indicative cost estimate on 10/12/08 of \$1,201,709.94. This amount included supporting works including the Druids Avenue Carpark and the Railway crossing ramps.

Below is our analysis and recommendation relating to the tender.

1. Tender Results:

In summary, the revised tenders received were (excluding GST):

| | |
|------------|--------------|
| Camco | \$955,983.45 |
| Civil Tech | \$984,423.37 |

2. Tender Analysis:

General

Tenders received were of a comparable nature with a breakdown of elements provided for all sections of the project. Prices varied according to individual rates and where single items were combined within other items; for example Camco included mulch within the planting line item.

1. Preliminaries

Preliminaries were comparable between tenders.

2. Site Preparation

Site Preparation was comparable between tenders. We note CIV provided a rate of 1x \$3,300 for Part 4 and a total of \$2,700. We believe this is an arithmetic mistake and the total should be \$3,300 increasing their overall tender price by \$500.

3. Demolition

CAM did not provide a separate price for demolition. We recommend that CAM confirms this item is included within the Earthworks component.

4. Earthworks +

5. Pathway

Direct comparison between tenders for the earthworks and pathway items is difficult due to the way prices have been provided as a proportional total for the whole project. The rate for the pathway from CIV is \$50.47 and the equivalent rate extracted from CAM's schedule is approx \$64.00.

As the pathway is the major cost for the project we recommend that CAM provide an inclusive rate for the pathway to be used for any variations or additional works and to define their allowance for earthworks.

6. Granulitic Sand

The rate from CAM is higher than CIV as it includes the steel edging from item 12.

7. Weed Eradication

The total prices for weed eradication were comparable, although we note the significantly lower price from CIV for the road reserve of the Freeway. We believe this does not adequately cover the required scope of works to remove the existing woody weeds.

8. Planting Beds +

9. Planting Supply +

10. Plant Install

The prices tendered for the Planting items varied and are reviewed as a total. CAM were marginally cheaper than CIV. We recommend that the plant sources and orders are confirmed at project startup in order to ensure supply of local provenance material to meet the project timeframe.

11. Mulch

CIV provided a mulch price for Part 3 only. This does not reflect the full scope of works where planting beds are provided throughout the project. CAM included mulch within the Planting prices above.

12. Edging

CAM included Edging within the price for granulitic sand in item 6 above. CIV included a price for edging in Part 3 and 4.

13. Irrigation

CAM did not provide a breakdown of irrigation within the schedule and it is not clear if this is covered elsewhere within the tender. We recommend that this item is clarified to ensure it is included within the scope. CIV provided irrigation price for Part 4 only which does not reflect the scope of works.

14. Bridges

CAM provided a lower price for the nominated bridges from Gunnerson Recreation. We understand that Council are considering this as a Principal Supply item in order to secure funding. We recommend that the price for installation is determined with the preferred contractor prior to award of the contract.

15. Boardwalk

Prices for the boardwalk were comparable with CAM providing a slightly lower price.

16. Street Furniture

Prices for the street furniture were comparable with CIV providing a slightly lower price.

17. Fencing

Prices for the Dunn Oval fencing were comparable however CAM provided a much lower rate for the Arc Mesh fencing resulting in a lower price overall.

18. Lighting

The prices for lighting were substantially different with CAM allowing for 9 lights at a rate of \$2,540.00ea and CIV allowing for 7 lights at \$690.00ea. The CAM rate is considered very high and requires clarification and confirmation that the lighting included is solar powered and no additional electrical connections are needed.

If the price is not revised, Council may wish to remove this from the scope of works and carry out the works in house.

19. Retaining Walls

Prices for the proprietary type retaining wall varied greatly. CIV was significantly lower than CAM. CAM's rate of \$553.44/m is considered high. We recommend the extent of works in confirmed prior to award of the contract.

20. Pipework, Culverts, Headwalls

CAM were significantly lower with their price for pipework. This item is difficult to separate as the tenderers did not include a breakdown of the individual items. We recommend Council confirms the scope prior to award of the contract.

21. Rock Mattress

The prices for rock mattresses varied greatly and it is not clear what has been included within the tender. We understand that a PC Sum of \$20,000 has been included within the contract to allow for scour protection works to address works during construction.

22. Signage

Prices for the signage were comparable with CIV providing a slightly lower price.

23. Traffic Management

Traffic Management is a key component of the project. Prices were comparable with CIV providing a slightly lower price. We recommend that the inclusions are clarified prior to award of the contract and rates provided for additional services if required due to access control throughout the project.

24. Maintenance

CAM provided a significantly lower price for 12 month maintenance.

25. As Built Survey

Prices for the as built survey were comparable.

26. Paving

There is only a small area of unit paving within the project at the entrance to the Caravan Park. The rate of \$238.73/m² from CAM is high and we recommend CAM provide justification for this rate.

27. Linemarking

CAM were significantly cheaper. We recommend that CAM confirm the linear metre allowance and rates to ensure the project scope is understood.

28. Cameron Road Intersection +**29. Gawler Street Intersection**

CIV did not provide a breakdown for works at Cameron Road and the Gawler Street Intersection price varied greatly. It is not clear if these works were included within the CIV pricing of other elements elsewhere.

30. PC Item

Disposal of material \$3,000

31. Other

CIV provided a price of \$7,958 for the railway crossing. This is currently not in scope. CAM did not include this item.

Non-Price Evaluation Criteria and Scoring

Oxygen assisted with the evaluation and scoring of non-price items based on information submitted during the project tender. The scoring results were combined and averaged from all assessors to provide an overall score as per the table below:

| Tender Criteria | CAMCO | CIVIL TECH | JB CIVIL/Colin Share |
|------------------------------|-------|------------|----------------------|
| Relevant Experience | 7 | 6 | 5 |
| Key Personnel | 7.5 | 5.5 | 6 |
| Resources | 6.5 | 5.5 | 6 |
| Project Understanding | 6.5 | 5.5 | 6 |
| Environmental Sustainability | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| Traffic Management | 7 | 4 | 4 |
| | 39.5 | 31.5 | 32 |

CAM scored consistently higher in all categories except Environmental Sustainability which was scored equally for all tenderers.

SUMMARY

The lowest tender submitted was by CAM. This was approximately 3% lower than the nearest tender. CAM also received the highest non-price scoring.

We understand there are no qualifications or exclusions from their tender that should be agreed before accepting a tender. We recommend an interview is conducted to provide clarifications of costs as recommended above and to discuss any outstanding details, site constraints or access issues before the awarding the contracts.

3. Capacity of Tenderer:

Oxygen has worked with CAM previously on trail construction within Cleland Conservation Park for the Department for Environment and Heritage. We believe CAM have the capacity, experience and resources to ensure the project is built to the standard required and to meet project milestones on time and budget.

Oxygen have not worked with CIV previously although we have contacted referees at Adelaide City Council who were happy with shared use path works provided in the Adelaide Parklands and had no hesitation in recommending them as a civil contractor.

4. Ability to Complete the Works

CAM have confirmed that resources are available to dedicate to the project and have proven capabilities within the commercial and civil industry and have the ability to complete the works as required.

5. Recommendation:

We recommend acceptance of the Camco Pty Ltd tendered price of **\$955,983.45 +GST** with the following additional allowances:

\$20,000 PC Sum for scour protection works

\$76,000 Construction contingency (approx 8.0% of tender sum)

We understand that this is within the current project budget of \$1,080,000.00.

6. Confidentiality:

The Code of Tendering AS4120, under which we are operating, requires that all information provided between Tenderers & Client shall be treated as confidential information. We request that this provision of the Code be respected.

Please let us know if we can provide further information or analysis.

Sincerely
Oxygen Pty Ltd

Jared Wilson
Senior Landscape Architect

ITEM 17.2 ATTACHMENT 3

Attachment 3 Scope of Works

- Site preparation
- Demolition of existing infrastructure
- Earthworks
- Construction of the pathway , including sub base.
- Supply and laying of granultic sand for turnarounds and furniture bases.
- Weed eradication
- Plant Supply & Installation.
- Supply and installation of natural mulch.
- Supply and installation of path edging
- Relocation of existing irrigation services
- Supply and installation of bridges.
- Supply and installation of a concrete boardwalk.
- Supply and installation of street furniture.
- Supply and installation of safety fencing
- Construction of crossing points at Gawler Street and Cameron Road.
- Supply and installation of solar bollard lighting.
- Supply and installation of retaining walls.
- Installation of pipe work, culverts, headwall and stormwater.
- Supply and installation of rock mattresses and scour protection.
- Supply and installation of signage.
- Traffic management.
- Defect and maintenance of landscaping and infrastructure (12 months)
- As built survey
- Pathway line marking.
- Bitumen sealing of the pathway.

ITEM 17.2 ATTACHMENT 4

Attachment 4. Trail Design

The design process as presented to Council at its meeting of December 15th 2008 included boundary identification and survey, identification of all services, investigation of alternate trail route options including privacy and security solutions and investigation of suitable road crossing options, the retention of significant trees, identification of drainage lines, investigation of possible pedestrian linkages to the CBD and the Tourist Park, detailed trail design and specifications, freeway tunnel upgrade potential, landscaping options including furniture, creek crossing options (bridges) and development of documentation for tendering purposes.

The design process undertaken since the report to the Council Meeting of the 15th December 2009 has included the following tasks

- Construction design drawings completed .
- Design Evaluated by Council's internal Review Team (April 2009)
- Expressions of Interests to construct the trail prepared and advertised.
- Expressions of Interest evaluated by panel .
- Four tender'ers selected to tender for trail construction .
- Tender documentation prepared.
- Tender advertised .
- Tenders evaluated .
- Tender evaluation panel required more information and detail from tenderers/.
- Tender Revision issued. Submissions closed Friday June 19th 2009.
- Tender evaluation panel met to review submissions and select a preferred Contractor.

